**PENNY MCKAY MEMORIAL AWARD**

**Evaluation Criteria for Review Panel Members**

*This form will be completed by members of the Review Panel in evaluating each application.*

**Applicant 1:**

1. **Based on the evidence provided by the thesis material and examiners’ and supervisor’s reports, how do you assess the overall contribution of the thesis to *knowledge about language education in the Australian (pre-) school context*?**

*Please tick one of the boxes below.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***The thesis is:*** | ***an outstanding contribution*** | ***a good contribution*** | ***a marginal contribution*** | ***an insignificant contribution*** |
|

**Please explain briefly the main reason(s) for your assessment:**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. **Based on the evidence provided by the thesis material and examiners’ and supervisor’s reports, what (if any) specific features of the thesis do you judge to be *innovative and/or distinctive*?**

*Please tick one box in each line below*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***Feature*** | ***highly innovative/ distinctive*** | ***somewhat innovative/ distinctive*** | ***minimally innovative/ distinctive*** | ***not innovative/ distinctive*** | ***Comments: please give some indication of the reason for this assessment*** |
| **Thesis question** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Research site(s)/context(s)** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Thesis methodology** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **How the findings are reported and/or analysed** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **The contribution made by the findings/conclusions** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **The clarity of the writing and presentation** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Anything else** *(please name) \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_* |  |  |  |  |  |

1. **Based on the abstract and thesis chapter that have been submitted, how do you rate the standard of *writing and presentation*? (Please tick one box)?**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***outstanding*** | ***very good*** | ***good*** | ***fair*** | ***poor*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |

*Please give some indication of the reason for your assessment:*

*\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*

1. **Are there any other outstanding characteristics of this thesis that particularly impress you?**

*Please explain briefly.*

*\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*

1. **Do you have any reservations about any aspect of this thesis?**

*Please explain briefly.*

*\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_***How do you rank this thesis in relation to doctoral research in language education worldwide?**

*Please tick one*

***Exceptional:* at the forefront of doctoral research in language education -- in the top 5 per cent worldwide.**

***Excellent:* at a very high international standard – in the top 20 per cent worldwide.**

***Very good:* an interesting, sound and compelling thesis – in the top 30 per cent worldwide.**

***Below the standard necessary for consideration for the Penny McKay Award.***

1. **Overall Recommendation**

*Please choose one*

**This submission is very worthy of the Award**

**This submission is worthy of the Award**

**This submission should not be given the Award.**

**Applicant 2:**

1. **Based on the evidence provided by the thesis material and examiners’ and supervisor’s reports, how do you assess the overall contribution of the thesis to *knowledge about language education in the Australian (pre-) school context*?**

*Please tick one of the boxes below.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***The thesis is:*** | ***an outstanding contribution*** | ***a good contribution*** | ***a marginal contribution*** | ***an insignificant contribution*** |
|

**Please explain briefly the main reason(s) for your assessment:**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. **Based on the evidence provided by the thesis material and examiners’ and supervisor’s reports, what (if any) specific features of the thesis do you judge to be *innovative and/or distinctive*?**

*Please tick one box in each line below*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***Feature*** | ***highly innovative/ distinctive*** | ***somewhat innovative/ distinctive*** | ***minimally innovative/ distinctive*** | ***not innovative/ distinctive*** | ***Comments: please give some indication of the reason for this assessment*** |
| **Thesis question** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Research site(s)/context(s)** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Thesis methodology** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **How the findings are reported and/or analysed** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **The contribution made by the findings/conclusions** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **The clarity of the writing and presentation** |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Anything else** *(please name) \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_* |  |  |  |  |  |

1. **Based on the abstract and thesis chapter that have been submitted, how do you rate the standard of *writing and presentation*? (Please tick one box)?**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***outstanding*** | ***very good*** | ***good*** | ***fair*** | ***poor*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |

*Please give some indication of the reason for your assessment:*

*\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*

1. **Are there any other outstanding characteristics of this thesis that particularly impress you?**

*Please explain briefly.*

*\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*

1. **Do you have any reservations about any aspect of this thesis?**

*Please explain briefly.*

*\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_***How do you rank this thesis in relation to doctoral research in language education worldwide?**

*Please tick one*

***Exceptional:* at the forefront of doctoral research in language education -- in the top 5 per cent worldwide.**

***Excellent:* at a very high international standard – in the top 20 per cent worldwide.**

***Very good:* an interesting, sound and compelling thesis – in the top 30 per cent worldwide.**

***Below the standard necessary for consideration for the Penny McKay Award.***

1. **Overall Recommendation**

*Please choose one*

**This submission is very worthy of the Award**

**This submission is worthy of the Award**

**This submission should not be given the Award.**

**PENNY MCKAY MEMORIAL AWARD**

**Ranking of Submissions by Review Panel Members**

**Please rank each application in order according to the strength of your recommendation for receipt of the Penny McKay Award.**

**If possible, give a separate ranking to each application. But if you really cannot find a *substantive* reason for distinguishing between submissions, you may rank more than one submission equally.**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| ***Ranking*** | ***Name of Applicant*** | ***Main reason for your ranking*** |
| 1. **(most favoured)** |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |