

# PENNY MCKAY MEMORIAL AWARD

## Evaluation Criteria for Review Panel Members

This form will be completed by members of the Review Panel in evaluating each application.

1. Based on the evidence provided by the thesis material and examiners' and supervisor's reports, how do you assess the overall contribution of the thesis to knowledge about language education in the Australian (pre-) school context?

Please tick one of the boxes below.

<i>The thesis is:</i>	<i>an <u>outstanding</u> contribution</i>	<i>a <u>good</u> contribution</i>	<i>a <u>marginal</u> contribution</i>	<i>an <u>insignificant</u> contribution</i>
-----------------------	---	-----------------------------------	---------------------------------------	---

Please explain briefly the main reason(s) for your assessment:

---



---



---



---

2. Based on the evidence provided by the thesis material and examiners' and supervisor's reports, what (if any) specific features of the thesis do you judge to be innovative and/or distinctive?

Please tick one box in each line below

<u>Feature</u>	<i>highly innovative/ distinctive</i>	<i>somewhat innovative/ distinctive</i>	<i>minimally innovative/ distinctive</i>	<i>not innovative/ distinctive</i>	<u>Comments: please give some indication of the reason for this assessment</u>
Thesis question					
Research site(s)/context(s)					
Thesis methodology					
How the findings are reported and/or analysed					
The contribution made by the findings/conclusions					
The clarity of the writing and presentation					
Anything else (please name)					

_____					
-------	--	--	--	--	--

3. Based on the abstract and thesis chapter that have been submitted, how do you rate the standard of **writing and presentation**? (Please tick one box)?

<i>outstanding</i>	<i>very good</i>	<i>good</i>	<i>fair</i>	<i>poor</i>

Please give some indication of the reason for your assessment:

---



---



---

4. Are there any other outstanding characteristics of this thesis that particularly impress you? Please explain briefly.

---



---



---



---

5. Do you have any reservations about any aspect of this thesis? Please explain briefly.

---



---



---

How do you rank this thesis in relation to doctoral research in language education worldwide?

Please tick one

**Exceptional**: at the forefront of doctoral research in language education -- in the top 5 per cent worldwide.

**Excellent**: at a very high international standard – in the top 20 per cent worldwide.

**Very good**: an interesting, sound and compelling thesis – in the top 30 per cent worldwide.

**Below the standard** necessary for consideration for the Penny McKay Award.

6. Overall Recommendation

Please choose one

This submission is very worthy of the Award

This submission is worthy of the Award

This submission should not be given the Award.

## PENNY MCKAY MEMORIAL AWARD

### Ranking of Submissions by Review Panel Members

---

Please rank each application in order according to the strength of your recommendation for receipt of the Penny McKay Award.

If possible, give a separate ranking to each application. But if you really cannot find a *substantive* reason for distinguishing between submissions, you may rank more than one submission equally.

<b><u>Ranking</u></b>	<b><u>Name of Applicant</u></b>	<b><u>Main reason for your ranking</u></b>
1. (most favoured)		
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		